Comments on Subacchi and Oxenford Increasingly apart: The Euro area and the UK

Donald Kohn
Robert S Kerr Senior Fellow
Brookings

Overview

- Good paper: informative analysis of UK and EA growth since the GFC.
- Highlights relative greater flexibility of UK labor market as major reason for superior UK growth.
- Agree labor market flexibility critical
 - Even more for intra EA adjustment

Comments: 2 fns on UK; macro policy contributions to disparate outcomes

UK Footnotes

- Importance of product market flexibility.
 - UK has high product market flexibility and ease of firm entry and exit.
- Risks of consumption driven growth with C/A deficit.
 - See US 2004-07
 - High HH debt
 - Vulnerability to shocks and amplification

Macro policy differences UK-EA (1)

- Fiscal policy
 - UK responded more forcefully to recession
 - Both UK and EA tightened since 2009, but UK still has less restrictive policy than EA, cyclically adjusted
 - In EA constraints on fiscal policy in periphery not offset by expansion in countries with fiscal space.

Macro policy differences UK-EA (2)

- Monetary policy
 - UK rapid forceful response to recession
 - Rates, QE, FLS
 - EA slow, initial reversals
 - Now forceful: negative rates, asset purchases
 - But interest rate increases in 2008, 2011
 - 2 percent as ceiling, not goal; responses to headline
 - Critical importance of nominal growth for debt sustainability

Macro policy differences UK-EA (3)

- Macroprudential regulation—bank recapitalization
 - Both back debts and use government capital in crisis
 - Recovery held back in both by tight bank credit
 - UK recognized earlier recapitalization required for lending
 - Stress measure of adequacy
 - Faster phase in of B3
 - Tradeoffs: FPC mitigates risk of added restraint in short run

- EA handicapped by sovereign risk and national responsibility for banks
- Apparently reluctant to force private capital raises
- Impetus from banking union and asset quality review helped, but late

Summary

- Good paper: learned a lot about UK-EA
- Labor market flexibility is critical
- But so are differences in fiscal, monetary, and macroprudential policies
 - EA handicapped by cumbersome decision making and divided responsibilities growing out of currency area made up of sovereign states.
 - Some progress toward centralized decision making e.g. for banking supervision—but enough?